



Re: Weekly Portland Harbor Ecorisk Call followup - Peer review comments on floating percentile model 

Burt Shephard to: humphrey.chip

02/02/2012 01:28 PM

AEbbets, anderson.jim, audiehuber, Bob Dexter, Brandy Humphreys,
Cc: colin, Conley.Alanna, cunninghame, dallen, Dan Phalen, DBeltman,
Elizabeth Allen, erin.madden, frenchrd, GAINER Tom,

All,

Attached are the peer review comments received by Washington Dept. of Ecology on their version of the floating percentile model proposed to develop freshwater sediment quality benchmarks under the State's Sediment Management Standards law. These are the comments Jim Anderson and I were talking about on this morning's call.

The external peer reviewers included Jay Field (NOAA), Chris Ingersoll (USGS), Alan Burton (University of Michigan), and Dave Mount (EPA). Although not comments on the specific iteration of the FPM used at Portland Harbor, the underlying model is the same as that used in the Portland Harbor BERA. Any comments or suggestions from these highly regarded reviewers that would have applicability to the Portland Harbor version of the FPM, both good and bad, should be utilized by us in our comments on the Portland Harbor BERA. In Ecology's comment responses, they did make use of some of the reliability statistics work several of us prepared as comments on the first draft of the BERA, which should give us an additional level of comfort going forward with our FPM reliability concerns.

For those of us who work on other Superfund sites with sediment contamination in the area, dredging projects in the Pacific Northwest, or deal with regulatory affairs at ports and harbors, it would be good to become familiar with these comments, even if you will not be providing comments on the Portland Harbor floating percentile model, since its likely the approach will reappear at other locations.

Best regards,

Burt Shephard
Risk Evaluation Unit
Office of Environmental Assessment (OEA-095)
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 10
1200 6th Avenue
Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 553-6359

Fax: (206) 553-0119

e-mail: Shephard.Burt@epa.gov

"If your experiment needs statistics to analyze the results, then you ought to have done a better experiment"

- Ernest Rutherford



Summary_Reviewer_Comments_Ecology_Responses Jam 2012.pdf